City Council 6:00pm, Tuesday, November 19, 2019 Council Chambers 1207 Palm Boulevard, Isle of Palms, SC

MINUTES

1. The invocation and the Pledge of Allegiance was followed by the roll call.

Present:Mayor Carroll, Council members Bell, Buckhannon, Ferencz, Kinghorn,
Moye, Rice, Smith, and Ward

Staff Present: Administrator Fragoso, City Attorney Copeland, Asst. City Administrator Hanna, City Department Heads

2. Appointment and Administration of Oath to New Employees

MOTION: Council Member Ward made a motion to approve the administration of oath and Council Member Moye seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Mayor Carroll administered the oath to Eric Bolen, Nick Russo, and Lawrence Daugherty of the Fire Department.

3. Reading of the Journals of Previous Meetings

MOTION: Council Member Ward made a motion to approve the minutes of the October 22, 2019 meeting, and Council Member Bell seconded the motion. The minutes were approved unanimously.

4. **Citizen's Comments**

Howard "Beach Santa" Hogue 445 Fedderbrush, Moncks Corner, spoke in favor of Ordinance 2019-19. He shared statistics about the number of cigarette butts and cigar tips picked up off the beach this year. He expressed concern about the chemicals that leach out of cigarette butts and how they end up in the water and food supply. He said he was taken aback that Ordinance 2019-18 did not pass First Reading in October, and he invited Council members to walk the beach with him next season to see for themselves the amount of improperly discarded cigarette butts.

Kelly Thorvalson, SC Aquarium, shared data of cigarette butts removed from the beach during a recent beach sweep. She said children are cleaning up toxic cigarette butts that adults cannot properly dispose of. She shared that similar smoking bans have proven to be successful, are self-policing, and reduce beach litter by 25%.

5. **Reports from Standing Committees**

Council Member Ward reviewed the financial reports, noting the unaudited fund balance of \$19,792,000 as of 6/30/2019 should remain as stated. He added the current forecast matches the budget so far this fiscal year.

A. Recommendation from the Accommodations Tax Advisory Committee for the City to approve sponsorship request from the IOP Turtle Team and the IOP Exchange Club for the Isle of Palms Turtle Hatching Scavenger Hunt in the amount of \$6,000 [State ATAX, General Government, Programs/Sponsorships - \$85,000 p. 22, ln. 20]

MOTION: Council Member Ward made a motion to approve the request for funding, and Council Member Rice seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

B. Recommendation from the Public Safety Committee to approve unbudgeted expenditure in an amount not to exceed \$10,000 for the purchase and installation of a safety camera at Breach Inlet

MOTION: Council Member Kinghorn made a motion to approve, and Council Member Ward seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

C. Recommendation from the Public Safety Committee to implement a Reserve Officer Program in the Police Department

Motion: Council Member Ward made a motion to approve and Council Member Moye seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

D. Recommendation from the Real Property Committee to apply to the Greenbelt Program to use the City's allocation for the construction of an ADA-Compliant Beach Walkover and Observation Deck at 42nd Avenue

MOTION: Council Member Bell made a motion to approve, and Council Member Rice seconded the motion.

Several Council members spoke in favor of this project and providing more handicapped access to the beach.

VOTE: The motion passed unanimously.

E. Consideration of an award to Insight Group, LLC in the amount of \$26,840 for construction management services for the Public Safety Building Repair Project [Capital Projects, Police, Capital Outlay - \$1,209,000, pg. 16, ln. 29; Capital Projects, Fire, Capital Outlay - \$2,324,500, pg. 16, ln. 41]

MOTION: Council Member Ward made a motion to approve, and Council Member Moye seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

F. Consideration of approval of an amount not to exceed \$100,000 for the 12-month rental of one (1) double-wide and one (1) triple-wide temporary offices for the Police and Fire Departments to use during the rehabilitation of the Public Safety Building [Capital Projects, Police, Capital Outlay - \$1,209,000, pg. 16, ln. 29; Capital Projects, Fire, Capital Outlay - \$2,324,500, pg. 16, ln. 41]

Motion: Council Member Bell made a motion to approve, and Council Member Moye seconded the motion.

Administrator Fragoso said, "We will go through the competitive bidding process that is required of us by the code. This is just a timing constraint based on the fact that Council does not meet in December, and this would allow me to execute a contract after the bidding process completes.

VOTE: The motion passed unanimously.

B. Public Safety Committee

Council Member Buckhannon reviewed the minutes of the November 4, 2019 Public Safety Committee meeting.

MOTION: Council Member Ward made a motion to approve the recommendation of the Public Safety Committee to revise the beach parking plan to include parallel parking and the 4' off pavement rule on Palm Boulevard between 41st and 53rd avenues and to implement parallel parking from 3rd to 9th avenues on Ocean Boulevard. Council Member Bell seconded the motion.

Administrator Fragoso explained the process by which the staff made the recommendations for the changes to the parking plan. She gave a brief presentation of the changes and the affected areas. She added, "I looked back at the minutes, the intent for the parking in those areas, which include again 3rd, 4th, 5th, 6th, 7th, and 9th, was for it to be parallel parking all along. Somehow that was not signed properly last year, and we want to go ahead and fix that." She stated the City would only need to purchase 24 new signs that could be hung on existing signposts by staff. She also added that the area past 53rd avenue would not be signed due to the presence of a swale ditch that does not allow parking 4' off the pavement, but the parking spaces would still be counted as parking spaces toward the City's public access definition. These changes do not require a revised SCDOT encroachment permit. Administrator Fragoso said she will review the beach parking plan to see how many, if any, parking spaces are being affected by these changes.

VOTE: The motion passed unanimously.

After a continued review of the minutes, Council Member Buckhannon noted to Council that the upcoming request to allow alcohol during the Holiday Festival will be forthcoming for all future outdoor City-sponsored festivals.

C. **Public Works Committee**

Council Member Rice reviewed the minutes of the November 14, 2019 Public Works Committee meeting. Director Kerr gave an update on the status of the Phase III Drainage project. He reported the lingering issue is where OCRM will draw their jurisdictional lines, which could affect the City's mitigation requirement. When asked about whether or not the City will be allowed to dredge the ditches, Director Kerr said, "I don't think so. From what I hear, the public good will trump the environmental issues if there are some. So it is that we would be authorized to do it. It is just that we would potentially have to pay into a mitigation fund or come up with mitigating projects that would offset the environmental damage that we are doing." He added that once a baseline is established with OCRM, the City will be able to maintain the ditches without going through a permitting process. Mayor Carroll asked about the height of the outfalls,

and Director Kerr said the height of the outfalls used Hurricane Joaquin as a standard but could still be overwhelmed by a major storm event. "The engineers really did pick the elevation that they could reasonably protect to," Director Kerr added.

Following further review of the minutes, Council Member Rice referred to Council Member Kinghorn's questions regarding the Water & Sewer Commission from the October Ways & Means Committee meeting.

Council Member Kinghorn: Only to say that last month there were a series of questions directed at the Chair and the Mayor that were to be answered at that meeting, and they were not.

Council Member Rice: Do you feel like your questions have been answered since then?

Council Member Kinghorn: No.

Mayor Carroll: May I give some answers?

Council Member Rice: Absolutely.

Mayor Carroll: So your first question was about a full-service, and I look at our City, and I see our fire department, our police department, our recreation department, our public works department, and yes a water and sewer department. So I think we are pretty full service. For the first question.

Council Member Kinghorn: May I respond?

Mayor Carroll: Yes, sir. Please.

Council Member Kinghorn: A full-service city, by definition, includes water and sewer. Most citizens in Isle of Palms view that the water and sewer authority is, in fact, an enterprise of the City. It is not. To have a full-service city, we are talking about folks in Aiken or Greenville or Charleston or Rock Hill. You have fire, water, public safety, public works. It is inclusive. Our situation is not.

Mayor Carroll: Okay. Number two. Why wouldn't you want the control of our destiny related to these two key services? Well, regardless of whether the water and sewer is a department or remains a commission is still based on a charge. It is a non-profit. They charge the same amount that we, if we ran it, we would have to charge the same amount. It is a non-profit making organization. So, it is just more government the way I look at it, and the way that I have talked to water and sewer, and I also talked to Clay Duffie, who is the Water & Sewer Commissioner from Mt. Pleasant, Chairman, who says in 1991, it is going to be when we took it over. 1992 is when we made it a commission, and he goes there is a reason why you all did that, and there is a reason why we did that. He goes why change it. I think Councilman Ward was instrumental in 1990 going to the Beach Company and proposing the City buying the water company, the Water & Sewer company.

Council Member Ward: That is correct.

Mayor Carroll: Anything else you want to expand on that or -

Council Member Ward: Butch went to Charlie Way. They just nominated me, the City Council, of course, I was a CPA, to go down there and beat up on Charlie Way. And so, he said he wanted the City, he did not even know what he wanted for it. He wanted \$1.6 million for it, and the City authorized me to offer him \$1.3 million. So I said, well, the City authorized me to offer you \$1.3 million, and he said okay. Anything else, Jimmy? No, sir. So I came back. We got it, and we figured it was so big that we needed a commission, and it was just too much work for us. That is why, one of the reasons why we had the Isle of Palms Water & Sewer Commission was formed.

Council Member Kinghorn: So the point of the question is we do not have direct influence over what happens with regards to water and sewer, two of the most important services that are provided to any municipality. This is not picking on our Commission. This is the case in commissions and where full-service cities are operating throughout the state, throughout the country. You do not have direct influence. No matter the minor thing you want to do or something as significant as what was proposed recently with \$16 million in bonding. The future development of the enterprise that is problematic, and we have discussed this at great length.

Council Member Bell: Jimmy?

Mayor Carroll: Yes, sir. Councilman Bell.

Council Member Bell: Just to Council Member Kinghorn's comments. I do not think it is an indictment of the existing commission. I will say sitting up here for two years anticipating having a meeting with Water & Sewer where we do not have control. It has taken over 20 months. No meeting. It was before us for \$16 million with little detail. When I look at things, I want to understand at the core what that detail represents. Right? So we still have 1400 septic systems. We sit up here and have massive debates on how do we get all residents connected to sewer systems with rising sea levels and the other issues that we have. Then we defer back to a Water & Sewer Commission who came before us for \$16 million without the breakdown of how much of that \$16 million is for necessary replacement or repairs in Wild Dunes versus future infrastructure for a connection that we cannot figure out sitting up here at this table. I struggle with puzzles that have missing pieces. For me, it is a puzzle with a missing piece. We do not have any control. The only authority we have is as a funding body. So while the history lessons are nice, looking forward, the amounts are staggering, and without this Council or future councils having some engagement beyond the sidelines for whether or not we can even get a meeting with Water & Sewer, for me, is completely unacceptable.

Mayor Carroll: Anyone else on that? So, you went into question three. Who would support -

Council Member Bell: It was my segue.

Mayor Carroll: Segue to question three – a personal loan given the information we have here? There was a person across the street who was not forthcoming with information. Previously, there was not a lot of information provided. When Council finally did get the information, it was at the last minute. That has been addressed, and the information will be provided in the future. And I also think it is prudent for this Council this coming year to think about having several representatives attend the Water & Sewer Commission. I think we need to be part of that. We

need to have a voice in that. It is like when we had storm events, and we had OpCons and we have everybody come together, but yet we did not have the Water & Sewer coming over and joining us. That is changing. We have got new communication across the street. I am very pleased with it, but I think it is something I think Council can look at. Number four, why wouldn't you want to cross-train economics of scale across departments? And we look at that like our police department and our fire department and our public works department and our recreation department. They do not cross train each other, nor would we cross train with the Water & Sewer. There are professionals over there who run that. I cannot imagine that Recreation is going to go over and work on that or Public Works is going to go over there and cross train when they have their hands filled. Or the Police Department or the Fire Department. So again, cross-training was kind of far-fetched one but is a good question, and I commend you for asking. Go ahead and fill in.

Council Member Kinghorn: Contrary to being far-fetched, anybody that has worked in a professional environment understands the benefit in the economies of scale of cross-training. And if you are not doing it, you are missing opportunities. Now, all but the Rec chairman, who really is not directly involved in this issue, it is important that the citizens hear this again. It has been discussed at previous meetings. All of the City department heads have noted very clearly in their own areas of influence the benefit it would have if Water & Sewer was operated as a City department. Right? Not Ted Kinghorn. Not anybody else on this Council. The professionals that run our departments because they understand what other cities do. They have more experience than many of us have indicated this would be preferable for a whole host of reasons.

Mayor Carroll: Thank you. Why wouldn't you want to be directly responsible for safety and fire to citizens related to water? I think that goes back to maybe having somebody from the City Council attend the meetings and maybe someone from the Fire Department. I was told that there are times when a fire hydrant is frozen, and they call it, Water & Sewer, they go down and open it up. This comes back to that communication and having involvement with the two. Yes, sir. Mr. Kinghorn?

Council Member Kinghorn: Go ahead.

Mayor Carroll: Yes, ma'am?

Council Member Rice: Is that it?

Mayor Carroll: No, no. I have got more. Why wouldn't you want to be...fully responsible for the Water & Sewer finance rates, debt revenue, and the quality of services? If Water & Sewer were a department, the cost of the service would not change unless it was the intent of the City to raise rates to offset some other cost within the City. Refer to question 1. It is a non-profit. The money that they charge is for the running of the business they have over here. Go ahead. Yes, sir?

Council Member Buckhannon: Point of order. Is there a motion? Or is just -

Mayor Carroll: No, these are questions he has asked -

Council Member Rice: No, this was, it is on the agenda.

Council Member Kinghorn: It is a discussion and I appreciate the dialog, and I hope all the members of the Council do, and while it might take a little time, I hope that our citizens do.

Council Member Ward: Where is it on the agenda?

Council Member Rice: It was on our Public Works agenda that is in my report.

Council Member Kinghorn: Why are we quibbling over this when we are going to wrap it up?

Council Member Rice: Yeah, we are going to wrap it up.

Council Member Kinghorn: There are many examples throughout the state, one classic one in this non-profit characterization, is when Dupont ran the Savannah River site. It is a multi-billion-dollar enterprise, and they said we only make \$1 a year. They employed 13,000 people on average, and they said they made \$1 a year. What do you think the effect of a multi-billion-dollar program is year in and year out of a government contract and how that affects your bottom line throughout your corporation? The fact is the last time there was major debt that was approved by the City for the Water & Sewer Authority shortly thereafter, and of course, there were recommended rates, but after that, guess what? The rates went up. So whether the rates go up or down, whether is the service is excellent or poor, I would rather have the City that is directly responsible for the other services run the operation. Let me close by saying this is pretty indicative of concerns that I have had for the four years I have served. There seems to be a lack of interest in reform and innovation by Council. And all you have to do is go as far as your staff and be open-minded enough and ask them what are best practices, where can we engage in reform and make the City operate better, and where can we innovate to provide better services for the City? Thank you.

Mayor Carroll: And you segued to the last question, so thank you very much. Anyone else?

Council Member Rice: I am going back to my report.

Mayor Carroll: Yes, ma'am. Thank you.

Council Member Rice: So, I think in the coming year there will likely be lots of dialogue with the new Council regarding the Water & Sewer, and hopefully, the communication will greatly improve. And maybe this is the best path would be for it to become a department of the City, but that is going to take a lot of people coming together and deciding that it is the best way to go.

Upon completing her review of the minutes, Council Member Rice was recognized by Mayor Carroll for her years of service to the City.

D. Recreation Committee

Council Member Smith reviewed the minutes of the November 4, 2019 Recreation Committee meeting. She shared that much of the meeting was centered around a discussion about a community pool.

E. Personnel Committee

Council Member Moye reviewed the minutes of the November 12, 2019 Personnel Committee meeting. He clarified the new policy regarding appointments to the Board and Commissions by saying, "after serving consecutive terms, your position will be opened and you may apply for that, but we will go through the interview process again with everyone who applies so that we at least have the opportunity to consider new applicants for the positions that are being opened." It will go into effect in 2020.

MOTION: Council Member Moye made a motion to recommend the reappointments of Malcolm Burgis, Sally Leydic Muhlig, David Nelson, and Rusty Williamson to the ATAX Committee, Elizabeth Campsen and Carolyn Holscher to the Board of Zoning Appeals, and Ron Denton and Lisa Safford to the Planning Commission. Council Member Rice seconded the motion.

Administrator Fragoso noted these recommendations will be presented again to City Council at the December 3 meeting and will be ratified at the January City Council meeting, adding that other nominations will be entertained as well.

Council Member Bell asked for clarification about the selection process and the policy for such that Council should expect to vote on in the future. Administrator Fragoso said the Personnel Committee will develop a more structured policy surrounding the selection process next year. Council Member Ferencz shared the Personnel Committee asked the boards and commissions for their input regarding the selection process.

VOTE: The motion passed unanimously.

Council Member Moye noted there is a vacancy on the Planning Commission after Mr. Philip Pounds is inaugurated to City Council in January. Applications for this opening are online and being accepted through December 31. Administrator Fragoso said the new City Council orientation and training handbook will be distributed at the December 3, 2019 meeting for review. Council Member Moye suggested a discussion next year about the length of time between an election and inauguration as well as the issue surrounding plurality in the election.

F. Real Property Committee

Council Member Bell reviewed the minutes of the November 6, 2019 Real Property Committee meeting.

6. **Reports from City Officers, Boards, and Commissions**

- A. Accommodations Tax Advisory Committee no meeting in November
- B. Board of Zoning Appeals minutes attached
- C. **Planning Commission** minutes attached
- 7. Reports from Special or Joint Committees none
- 8. **Petitions Received, Referred, or Disposed of** none
- 9. Bills already in Possession of Council none

10. Introduction of New Bills, Resolutions, and Proclamations

A. Ordinance 2019-16 – AN ORDINANCE AMENDING TITLE 6, HEALTH AND SANITATION, CHAPTER 1, GENERAL PROVISIONS, ARTICLE B – NUISANCES. An Ordinance to establish new standards for dilapidated structures.

MOTION: Council Member Bell made a motion to suspend the rules of order to allow discussion of Ordinance 2019-16. Council Member Ferencz seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Administrator Fragoso said the redline version of this ordinance includes "some selections from the international Property Maintenance Code to address some of the concerns raised by residents related to vacant structures that are not being well-maintained on the island. This code, the amendment to this code, which is in front of you, would require that all homes, both occupied and those that are vacant, keep the exterior walls in good condition, protected by paint or other covering, free of cracks, breaks, rot, and excessive mildew. Also keep the roofs free of leaks. Stairs, decks, porches, railings, and handrails, they should be properly attached and structurally sound. Also, keep pools in good repair with filters on to ensure that the water is clean and sanitary. There is a provision also included as part of the amendment in front of you that allows staff to review properties on a case-by-case basis in the event of a disaster-declared event."

Director Kerr noted that this ordinance does give the City more to ensure that a building is properly taken care of, but a compliant structure "may still look awful." Council Member Bell stated that ordinances such as 2019-16 are about "trying to gain public consensus for appropriate behavior. It is not to legislate each individual event." Council members discussed whether this ordinance was overreach, if the current code already provided the City a means to deal with these issues, and whether or not it will make a difference over time. Council Member Smith expressed concern about the subjectivity of the ordinance and how it will be applied. Administrator Fragoso responded by saying, "I will say if it becomes an ordinance it is something that the City staff needs to apply consistently across the board. We discussed that at the meeting, and as soon as one person gets a ticket, they start seeing issues in other properties as well. I think we need to be very careful about ensuring that the enforcement mechanism applies consistently across the board."

Council Member Bell added, "This has been addressed completely as a public safety issue. Just for clarity for everybody." With regards to consistency, he said, it does not mean "that for every violation that is contained within this code, that if somebody has mold on the side of their house, that the mold police show up and tell you you have mold."

Director Kerr said, "I will just forewarn the Council that whenever I charge somebody with anything, the very first thing they do the next day is bring me a list of the four other things that they feel like are as bad as what they, so it becomes whether I want to put it under a microscope or not... it immediately gets analyzed for consistent behavior." As other issues come out, the City will have to be consistent in applying the code.

MOTION: Council Member Ferencz made a motion to approve Ordinance 2019-16, and Council Member Bell seconded the motion. A vote was taken as follows:

Ayes: Smith, Bell, Kinghorn, Ward, Rice, Ferencz Nays: Buckhannon, Moye, Carroll

Ordinance 2019-16 passed First Reading.

Administrator Fragoso said, "The Pending Ordinance Doctrine means that once it is approved at First Reading, then any complaints or any enforcement that comes after would comply with the current ordinance as approved."

B. Ordinance 2019-19 – AN ORDINANCE AMENDING TITLE 6, HEALTH AND SANITATION, CHAPTER 4, SMOKING IN THE WORKPLACE. An Ordinance to prohibit smoking on the beach.

MOTION: Council Member Moye made a motion to suspend the rules of order to allow for discussion of Ordinance 2019-19. Council Member Rice seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Council Member Ferencz asked how this ordinance is different than the one voted on in the October meeting. Council Member Smith said, "The main intent all along has been to focus on cigarettes and smoking at the beach, but we did have this other language, which was actually impactful in regard to City-owned properties, and I think out of the conversation that has emerged, I think for this moment, focusing on the beach is the right thing to do." She said that keeping smoking off the beach does allow space for people to smoke lawfully. She also said the City could provide additional trash receptacles off the beach for cigarette trash. She stated, "This has never been about trying to get people to stop smoking. This is about the impact that smoking has on the litter and the smoke has on the people around them." She believes the City needs to do more to provide a clean and healthy beach to citizens and visitors.

Council Member Bell stated he had been unsure how to vote on this ordinance and commended Council Member Smith on her comments. He said passing this ordinance is consistent with the ordinance this council passed banning plastics in a unanimous vote. Of this ordinance he said, "It is a gradual behavior change that is consistent with the 85% of the people in the country that do not smoke."

Council Member Rice said there is no reason to not pass the ordinance "when we know it will help."

Council Member Moye said that while it is easy to vote no, he believes City Council as to make a choice to be a leader in protecting the environment.

Council Member Ferencz said she thought this ordinance was as a result of a litter problem and wondered what the City will do to get rid of the litter. Ordinance 2019-19, she said, will just take the litter elsewhere.

Council Member Kinghorn made a motion to amend Ordinance 2019-19 to include the beach front parking lots, but Administrator Fragoso reminded him amendments can be made at Second Reading. He noted that while a smoking ban on the beach will move litter elsewhere, it will be imperative to have an education program about all aspects of littering.

Council Member Smith added that Sullivan's Island City Council unanimously passed a smoking ban at their meeting tonight, and it is important that the City Council consider what their neighboring island is doing to prevent the Isle of Palms from becoming everyone's ashtray.

Council Member Buckhannon said to see a real change, City Council should ban cigarettes at the point of sale.

VOTE: A vote was taken as follows: Ayes: Smith, Bell, Kinghorn, Rice, Moye Nays: Ward, Buckhannon, Ferencz, Carroll

Ordinance 2019-19 passed First Reading.

MOTION: Council Member Smith made a motion reorder the agenda to and move to have Second Reading of Ordinance 2019-19 on the agenda for the December 3, 2019 City Council Meeting. Council Member Rice seconded the motion.

Council Member Smith said City Council has done business at past December meetings and passing Ordinance 2019-19 at that meeting will allow the City to tie messaging about the smoking ban into the messaging with the plastics ban as well as provide cohesive messaging with the smoking ban on Sullivan's Island. She added this is the Council that has the full history of the discussion on the ban, and this should be the Council to vote on it. Council Member Moye noted how that point ties back to his point about swearing in new Council members closer to the election as it was the community who chose them as their representatives. He said he could not support fast tracking the ordinance. Council Member Bell agreed this issue should be voted on by this Council. Further discussion of whether or not to have Second Reading of Ordinance 2019-19 centered around whether or not this Council should be the ones to vote it into law.

VOTE: A vote was taken as follows:

Ayes: Smith, Buckhannon, Kinghorn, Rice, Bell, Moye Nays: Ward, Ferencz, Carroll

C. Resolution 2019-03 – A resolution authorizing consumption of beer and wine only at the Holiday Street Festival on December 7, 2019

MOTION: Council Member Buckhannon made a motion to approve, and Council Member Smith seconded the motion.

Discussion ensued about whether allowing alcohol consumption is appropriate for a familyoriented and City-sponsored event.

VOTE: The motion passed unanimously.

11. Miscellaneous Business

The next regular meeting of the City Council will be Tuesday, January 28, 2020 at 6:00pm in Council Chambers. Mayor Carroll thanked outgoing Council members for their service and welcomed the incoming Council members.

12. **Executive Session** – none needed

13. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 8:09pm.

Respectfully submitted,

Nicole DeNeane City Clerk