

MINUTES OF THE ISLE OF PALMS
PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
October 8, 2014

The Isle of Palms Planning Commission met in the City Hall Conference Room, 1207 Palm Boulevard on October 8, 2014 at 4:50 p.m. Members attending included Bev Ballow, Ron Denton, Richard Ferencz, Bill Mills, Lisa Safford, Don Smith and Noel Scott; the Director of Planning Douglas Kerr was present as well. The press had been notified of the meeting and the agenda for the meeting was posted in City Hall and the Building Department to comply with the Freedom of Information Act.

The Chairman Noel Scott called the meeting to order.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Mr. Scott explained that the next item on the agenda was the approval of the July 9th, 2014 minutes. Mr. Mills made a motion to approve the minutes as drafted and Mr. Ferencz seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous in favor of the motion.

Mr. Scott explained that additionally there were minutes from a special meeting on July 16th, 2014 to be reviewed. Mr. Denton made a motion to approve the minutes as drafted and Mr. Smith seconded the motion. The vote was unanimous in favor of the motion.

REVIEW OF MARINA REDEVELOPMENT PROPOSALS

Ms. Safford stated that before the discussion of the proposals began, she wanted to disclose the fact that her husband was frequently hired by ADC as a subcontractor. She explained that she did not feel that this fact would inhibit from making fair judgments about each of the proposals and she did not believe there would be any financial gain to her family as a result of this project. Mr. Kerr explained that Ms. Safford would need to decide whether or not she felt she had a conflict and that the basis for making that decision should be whether or not there is any financial interest in the matter that would affect her family. Ms. Safford answered that she did not believe that she had a conflict of interest.

Mr. Kerr explained that the City had received five proposals for the redevelopment master plan of the marina. He suggested that the group review each proposal at the meeting and then score each proposal in the following days. He stated that the Commission could then invite the two top scoring consultants to the next meeting to discuss their proposal and provide pricing to help the Commission make a recommendation to City Council. The Commission agreed with this strategy.

Mr. Kerr explained that he had distributed a cover summary as well as the excerpt from each proposal which addressed the tasks included in the request for proposals. In

alphabetical order, the first proposal to discuss was ADC. Mr. Kerr explained that the project manager would be Fred Guthier, a landscape architect; the marine expert would be Dennis Kissman of Marina Management Services; the financial analysis would be done by Chris Moore, a civil engineer with JGT and Bradley Aiken, with Aiken Cost Consultants. He explained that they had cited similar projects as being the Mount Pleasant Memorial Waterfront Park, the Isle of Palms Recreation Center Addition, the Isle of Palms Fire Stations 1 and 2, and the Isle of Palms facilities evaluation done by JGT.

Mr. Denton explained that he thought that the work experience appeared to be light on marina work specifically. Ms. Safford explained that she knew the group was well qualified to handle multidisciplinary work as needed by this project, but she agreed that the work examples appeared to be light on marina work. Mr. Scott explained that he thought that the chosen consultant would need to have a lot of experience with docks and marinas and he did not see this in ADC's proposal.

Mr. Kerr explained that the next proposal to discuss would be ATM. He explained that the project manager, marine expert and financial expert would be Kirby Marshall, a MBA with ATM; and additional marine and financial expertise would be provided by Justin Davis, a civil engineer and MBA with ATM. He explained that they had cited similar projects as being the Reserve at Lake Keowee in Sunset SC, Indian River Marina in Delaware, Gratwick Park Marina Redevelopment in New York and Virginia Key Marina Master Plan in Florida.

Mr. Denton explained that he felt that they had excellent work experience, but he was curious to know how much of ATM's workforce would be in the local area versus their other offices outside of the area. Mr. Scott explained that he agreed that their work experience appeared to closely match what the City needed for this project. Ms. Ballow explained that they appeared to include additional tasks in their proposal that were outside of the published request for proposals, which she questioned. Ms. Safford stated that she agreed that their work experience was strong in the area of marinas.

Mr. Kerr explained that the next proposal to discuss would be James Raih Real Estate and Development Company Inc. He explained that the project manager and financial expert would be James Raih, who held a MBA and had served on the Real Property Committee for City Council as well as the City's Planning Commission. He explained that the marine experts would be Walter Timpson, of MarinaResource, LLC. and John Mahoney of Moran Environmental Projects Group. He explained that they had cited similar projects as being Winding Waters RV Resort in Florida, Skidaway Island in Georgia and Decisions Dynamics in Florida.

Mr. Kerr explained that the next proposal to discuss would be Seamon Whiteside. He explained that the project managers would be Gary Collins and Bill Eubanks, landscape architects with Seamon Whiteside. He explained that the marine expert would be John Shaffer of SHFR and the financial experts would be Seth Clark and Peter Fennelly of Colliers International. He explained that they had cited similar projects as being the Port Royal Master Plan, Charleston Harbor Resort and Marina at Patriots Point and the Sullivan's Island Commercial District Master Plan.

Mr. Scott explained that he believed that the Charleston Harbor Resort was a major project in the local area, which may give the firm a good idea of what is needed for this project. Ms. Ballow explained that while she felt the firm could do a good job, she was not overly impressed with the proposal they submitted as it seemed to not address many of the items in the RFP. Ms. Safford agreed that they did not directly respond to the points included in the RFP. Mr. Ferencz stated that it appeared as though they may have responded to an early draft of the RFP that did not get published.

Mr. Kerr explained that the final proposal to discuss would be from Stantec. He explained that the project manager would be Brian Kizer, a civil engineer with Stantec. He explained that the marine experts would be Keith Bongirno, a landscape architect with Stantec and John Shaffer of SHFR. He explained that the financial expert would be Paul Lane with IWC. He explained that they had cited similar projects as being Powell Point in the Bahamas, Castaway Cay Island Resort in the Bahamas and Port of Falmouth of Jamaica.

Ms. Ballow explained that Stantec certainly has a handle on the parking issues within the City, as they are studying that issue for the City. Mr. Denton explained that he felt that they were very qualified and could do a good job with the project.

Mr. Kerr explained that he had distributed a scorecard for each consultant and asked that each Commissioner complete their scorecards and turn them in before October 17th. He explained that he would add up the scoring and contact the two consultants with the top scores and request that they appear at the next Planning Commission meeting and give a short presentation and provide pricing in a sealed envelope. The Commission agreed that this would be the path forward.

MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS- DISCUSS PUBLIC MEETING REGARDING PARKING

Ms. Safford explained that she was surprised at how many people spoke out against the idea of a parking pass system. Mr. Smith stated that he thought there would be more people from off the island objecting to the idea of paying to park.

Planning Commission Minutes
October 8, 2014
Page 4

ADJOURNMENT

With there being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:40 p.m.

Respectfully submitted, Noel Scott, Chairman